

# URBAN DESIGN ADVISORY PANEL

## MINUTES

MINUTES OF A MEETING OF THE URBAN DESIGN ADVISORY PANEL  
HELD AT 10.00 AM ON FRIDAY 22 MARCH 2019  
IN THE LADY OSBORNE ROOM, TOWN HALL

<b>MEMBERS PRESENT</b>	
<b>NAME</b>	<b>POSITION</b>
Peter Curtis	Panel Member and Chairman
Jamieson Allom	Panel Member
Ian James	Panel Member
George Wilkie	Panel Member
Susan Small	Panel Member

  

<b>ALSO PRESENT</b>	
<b>NAME</b>	<b>POSITION</b>
Rohan Probert	Manager Development Appraisal
Cameron Sherriff	Development Appraisal Planner
Rachel Rust	Executive Officer – City Planning
Bec Grace	Senior Administrative Officer – City Planning
Qian Pei Choi	Project Manager

### **PLN-18-770 – 209-213 HARRINGTON STREET - DEMOLITION AND NEW BUILDING FOR 39 MULTIPLE DWELLINGS, FOOD SERVICES AND GENERAL RETAIL AND HIRE**

The Panel met with the Planning Consultant George Walker from 6ty°, who explained the proposal and responded to questions.

The Panel did note the absence of any member from the Design Team who could explain and respond to architectural and urban design aspects of the Proposal raised by the Panel. In so doing the Panel acknowledged that the Planning Scheme, in respect of the Commercial Zone, requires virtually no consideration of these matters.

The Panel subsequently met in camera to discuss the proposal in detail and the advice below is provided for the consideration of the proponents, officers and Aldermen.

#### **Description:**

This planning application proposes the demolition of existing buildings, and the construction of a new residential apartment and retail building comprising four levels,

containing 39 residential apartments in the upper three levels, and two commercial tenancies, car parking (38 spaces), bicycle parking, lobby, pedestrian and vehicle access in the ground level. Awnings will extend over the footpath from both the Harrington Street and Patrick Street facades. All titles making up the subject site will be consolidated as part of the proposal. The building is proposed to have a height of approximately 14.2 metres.

This application is a revised application from the previously withdrawn PLN-17-967 - Demolition and New Building for Multiple Dwellings, General Retail and Hire and Food Services, and Minor Associated Road Works. The Panel did view the original application on 9 February 2018. In its consideration of the original proposal the Panel raised a number of concerns regarding the bulk and scale of the development.

The Applicant in revising the original application has focused on reducing the overall height of the current development proposal to below 15 metres; therefore complying with the acceptable solution for building height under the Planning Scheme, thus avoiding the need to comply with the relevant Performance Criteria.

#### **Comments:**

The Panel raised a number of issues in regards to the current proposal.

- The protection of residential amenity (setback) with the balconies and windows located on the boundary of the site. The Panel raised concern that the design is unlikely to comply with the Building Code of Australia and that the applicant should seek advice from a building surveyor before proceeding further with the Application.
- The Panel suggested that a design statement that illustrated and justified the design process that had led to the development proposal would have been of benefit to the Panel and demonstrated that some rigour had been exercised in respect of that process.
- The Panel felt that the design of the lobby was awkward as it lacked a linkage to the stairs. It was also noted that the split floor levels incorporating steps leading to alternate fire exits may raise concerns around the adequacy of disability access and fire safety.
- The first floor of the proposal above the car park shows an outdoor area of vacant space. The Panel raised the opportunity for landscaping within this space and suggested this could be utilised as a common area for residents.
- The ground floor shows no internal access to garbage disposal area. The Panel felt that there should be an internal connection to the garbage disposal area for both residents and the occupiers of the retail space.

- The Panel notes that the proposal includes no external common spaces or landscaping and suggests that consideration be given to the provision of outdoor dining, landscaping and greenery that would encourage interaction from the street and where possible with neighbouring properties. The canopy/awning projection over the footpath was also noted as being very shallow.
- The Panel did consider the elevational treatment patterns to be an improvement on the previous application however believes that the lobby / entrance section to the north-west end of the building could be improved with a glazed panel or similar for additional natural light.
- Concerns were raised regarding the colour palette and finishes. The Panel believed that the-black, white and grey concrete finishes were particularly austere for a prominent residential complex in this location.

More broadly, the Panel suggests that the application should be withdrawn or deferred in its current form so the issues with the Building Code (including disability access provisions) can be reviewed.

The Panel also questions the adequacy of the Planning Scheme in its ability to promote and protect residential amenity in the Commercial Zone as this current proposal basically complies with the Scheme provisions. The Panel sees very little support from within the Scheme to champion a better design outcome.